

Open, transparent and merit-based recruitment checklist (2018 - 2022)

OTM-R checklist for organizations					
	Open	Trans- parent	Merit- based	Answer: Yes, completely Yes, substantially Yes, partially No	Current status / Indicators / Future actions
OTM-R system					
1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	x	x	x	Yes, substantially	The IDIBELL Policy for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment is published on the IDIBELL website and available for download at this link: https://idibell.cat/en/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2021/03/Recruitment-and-selection-policy.pdf The translation of the document into the local language(s) is pending.
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?	x	x	x	Yes, partially	Upon the expected incorporation of a new member of the Talen Unit in April 2021, a guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all positions will be created and send out to all staff. For R3 and R4, internal guidelines (Model for Development of the IDIBELL Professional Research Career) set clear and explicit OTM-R procedures and have been applied for the last 3 years.
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	x	x	x	No	Upon the expected incorporation of a new member of the Talen Unit in April 2021, specific training courses on OTM-R will be developed and delivered to everyone involved in the selection and hiring process of IDIBELL personnel.
4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		No	We are currently benchmarking against different e-recruitment tools and solutions. With the recent

					updates of the IDIBELL website, we are further developing the webpage to advertise job openings and have created a new e-mail account for submission of job applications (jobs@idibell.cat). IDIBELL is currently implementing a new enterprise resource planning (ERP) system that includes a built-in recruiting tool. Once fully implemented, we will assess whether it this recruiting software will be suitable to fulfill the requirements of the current OTM-R procedures.
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x	x	Yes, partially	For R3 and R4, but also top management roles, IDIBELL keeps sex disaggregated data on all phases of the recruitment process (i.e., application screening and shortlisting, interview process, selection of the successful candidate). From 2018 to 2020, IDIBELL has received 12 applications for tenure-track positions (6 men:2 women). In 2021, we have received applications from 2 women. Our current Equality and Diversity Management Plan supports gender equality and diversity, promoting integration of inclusion principles into the institution's hiring practices.
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	Yes, completely	Our OTM-R policy does not have specific rules to encourage external candidates to apply, but the higher standards of the evaluation system makes it very difficult to succeed without having any previous international experience. The lack of suitable e-recruitment tools do not allow us to obtain specific numbers, but all R1 candidates are external and more than 90% of R2 are also from outside IDIBELL. The Model for Development of the IDIBELL Professional Research Career for R3 and R4 states that only those succeeding in calls such as Miguel Servet or Ramon y Cajal can get tenured

					and promoted. Thus, 75% of the candidates for Miguel Servet calls during 2018-2020 were from outside our institute. Also, incorporation of talent into the Management Support group focuses on external candidates, being almost 100% external candidates.
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	Yes, completely	<p>The IDIBELL Policy for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment encourages researchers from abroad to apply for all research open positions as no language proficiency other than having a good command of the English language are required. Publication of job adverts on the EURAXESS job platform allows for the broader dissemination of job openings in order to attract international candidates. In addition to research jobs, the EURAXESS platform is also used to publish scientific and management support job openings.</p> <p>Currently, the lack of recruiting software tools do not allow us for effective tracking of any trend in the share of applicants from abroad. The number of personnel from abroad has increased in a 14.18% from 2018 to 2019 besides the grand total number of international research personnel has been maintained the same (69 and 70 researchers in 2018 and 2019, respectively). The distribution by researcher career stages has not significantly changed either, with 27 and 32 predoctoral researchers (R1), 28 and 25 postdoctoral researchers (R2), 8 and 7 principal investigators (R3), and 6 group leaders and research emeritus (R4) in 2018 and 2019, respectively. Noteworthy, due to the departure of several research groups in 2019 (and later in 2020), the number of international researchers has dropped to 43, with</p>

					<p>the most significant leave of R1 and R2 (18 and 16 predoctoral and postdoctoral researchers, respectively, were active in 2020). Regarding attraction of tenure-track researchers, 75% of the candidates were from abroad (6 externals and 2 internals, over a period of 3 years)</p>
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	Yes, completely	<p>The IDIBELL Policy for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment refers to the Equality and Diversity Management Plan (translated to English early in 2021 and under revision as to fulfill with new obligations regarding equality as for the Royal Decree 901 and 902/2020).</p> <p>The current IDIBELL Policy for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment ensures equal opportunities among women and men and at the intersectional level in the recruitment and selection of new talent. The current policy ensures the protection of people in employment from discrimination, victimization, harassment or any other detriment because of any protected characteristics. In addition, for R3 and R4 positions, at least 1 woman should make it to the final interview. In the instance no women is listed for the final interview, the selection process shall stop and a job advert published again.</p>
9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	Yes, completely	<p>IDIBELL's current financial situation does not allow for starting packages for newly recruited tenure-track positions. However, we have put in place several initiatives in order to offer better working conditions (i.e., vouchers for scientific platforms, seed budget for collaborative proof-of-concept projects, budget to retain young talent (bridge grants for Master's students prior to enrolling any Ph.D. program), small packs of basic lab</p>

					equipment, etc.). For managerial staff, we are currently developing regulations for teleworking and flexible working hours in order to improve the life and work balance.
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				Yes, partially	For R3 and R4 (Model for Development of the IDIBELL Professional Research Career), but also for top management roles, specific selection criteria have been defined. Besides such a tracking system is not yet implemented for all research positions, IDIBELL is committed to collect most relevant KPIs: percentage of applicants that do not fulfill the eligibility criteria, number of eligible candidates disaggregated by sex, nationality and age (when information may be available), duration of the recruitment process, and duration of the selection process. Moreover, we aim to identify the reason why certain vacancies may remain open for longer periods of time or need to be published again.
Advertising and application phase					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		Yes, completely	A new job advert template has been created as to refer to the current IDIBELL Policy for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment. Job adverts now include a statement on flexible working hours and the commitment of the institute to promote diverse and inclusive working conditions. Job adverts also include a brief description of the selection process. Pre-selected candidates that receive an invitation to interview receive details about the technical and competency-based interviews, and are provided information about the members of the selection committee (i.e., full name and position).

<p>12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?</p>	<p>x</p>	<p>x</p>		<p>Yes, partially</p>	<p>During the last two years we have updated all our core informatic systems and website. We have migrated from our own server to the Microsoft 365 environment; we have developed a new website (first based on Joomla and later on WordPress) that significantly have improved our workflow and day-to-day activities. However, several documental repositories and links to relevant content were broken during this process. We currently do not include all links and references in job advertisements, but we are in the process of implementing new e-tools to make the whole recruitment process more efficient. In our job advert template, we refer to our current OTM-R policy and provide the URL link to our website. We believe that the webpage dedicated to job openings can be further improved, being one of our priorities in 2021.</p>
<p>13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?</p>	<p>x</p>	<p>x</p>		<p>Yes, substantially</p>	<p>The share of jobs adverts posted on EURAXESS is 33 (2018), 11 (2019), 10 (2020), and 12 (2021). Currently, the lack of recruiting software tools do not allow us for effective tracking of any trend in the share of applicants from abroad. The number of personnel from abroad has increased in a 14.18% from 2018 to 2019 besides the grand total number of international research personnel has been maintained the same (69 and 70 researchers in 2018 and 2019, respectively). The distribution by researcher career stages has not significantly changed either, with 27 and 32 predoctoral researchers (R1), 28 and 25 postdoctoral researchers (R2), 8 and 7 principal investigators (R3), and 6 group leaders and research emeritus (R4) in 2018 and 2019, respectively. Noteworthy, due to the departure of several research groups in 2019 (and later in 2020), the number of</p>

					international researchers has dropped to 43, with the most significant leave of R1 and R2 (18 and 16 predoctoral and postdoctoral researchers, respectively, were active in 2020).
14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		Yes, completely	Biocat, Euraxess, OFER-TRABEC of RedIRIS, and Red de Entidades Gestoras de Investigación Clínica (REGIC), LinkedIn, and a few paid portals when appropriate.
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?	x			Yes, Completely	In order to keep the recruitment process burden to the minimum for all candidates, applicants are asked to declare all information provided is current and accurate, and they must commit to providing proof of any degree or legal document once the selection process concludes.
Selection and evaluation phase					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees?		x	x	Yes, substantially	As defined in the Model for Development of the IDIBELL Professional Research Career, the panels for selection of candidates for tenure-track positions are clearly defined. Selection panels are constituted by the General Director, Scientific Director and the program coordinator of the scientific program where the candidate will be appointed. Is important to mention that tenure-track researchers are pre-selected at IDIBELL, but the final selection is made by external members (from different disciplines, other institutions, other countries) as recommends the GEARING-Roles working document, in order to minimize unconscious biases.
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?		x	x	Yes, completely	The composition of the selection committee may vary based on the actual offered position and type of contract. Committees should be independent and gender-balanced as stated in the IDIBELL Equality and Diversity Management Plan.

					<p>All Selection Committees should consist of the following members and should include one third of one gender:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Hiring Manager/prospective supervisor (i.e., group leader, principal investigator, head of unit, head of department, area director) • A member of the Talent Unit A member of the research group or organization unit or department <p>All members of the Selection Committee are provided with standardized evaluation form templates.</p> <p>For tenure-track positions under the program Miguel Servet or Ramón y Cajal, CVs and project memories will be collected and an <i>ad hoc</i> committee formed by the Scientific Directorate, General Directorate, Coordinators of involved Programs and Talent Unit will prioritize candidates to maximize their success in such competitive calls. This circuit will also be implemented for any hiring process for R3 and R4 positions.</p>
<p>18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?</p>		<p>x</p>	<p>x</p>	<p>Yes, substantially</p>	<p>We are making big efforts to ensure all committees are independent and sufficiently gender-balanced as defined in the IDIBELL Equality and Diversity Management Plan. All Selection Committees should include one third of one gender. For management support positions, we keep track of the composition of selection panels in order to guarantee this requirement.</p>

<p>19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?</p>			x	Yes, substantially	<p>The current IDIBELL Policy for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment provides the framework to ensure that selection committees are sufficiently gendered-balanced. Selection committees will always be equitable regarding the gender (i.e., including one third of one gender). As stated in the IDIBELL Policy for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment, all selection committees will count with the attendance of one member of the Talent Unit to ensure that the process is following the institutional OTM-R policy and that the selection committee members' opinions are given the same weight.</p> <p>The promotion of tenure-track researchers (R3-TT) to a tenure position (R3) may take place provided that R3-TT researchers have passed the evaluation assessments by their funding agencies, which grant the relevant aids and upon satisfying the assessment by the Catalan Health Institute (a committee formed by General Directors of all health research institutes in Catalonia) on completing the program. Prior to assessment by the Catalan Health Institute committee, IDIBELL will evaluate R3-TT researchers (Spanish research agency). This evaluation process guarantees that the researcher is adjusted to the requirements desired by IDIBELL, and will set the scale to be promoted to an R3 position and future career progression.</p>
Appointment phase					
<p>20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?</p>		x		Yes, completely	<p>All applicants are informed about the final status on the selection process via e-mail. Candidates that do not fulfill the selection criteria are rejected and</p>

					informed immediately after closing the recruitment phase. Candidates who move forward in the selection process and discarded at the end of the selection process are informed accordingly once the successful candidate accepts the job offer.
21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?		x		Yes, substantially	Due to the high volume of processes and candidates, feedback is only given to those reaching the final interview and to candidates who request it. Contractual terms are negotiated with the successful candidate via phone call and non-selected candidates are informed about the status of their candidacy via e-mail. In those communications, aside of informing them regarding the final resolution, feedback is provided for non-selected candidates to improve their future applications and to ensure they understand the final decision of the hiring manager.
22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?		x		No	So far we do not have any complaints mechanism in place rather than addressing these complaints via e-mail in case they may arise. For the last three years, we have not received any complaints, but we cannot confirm if this is due to the lack of an appropriate complaints mechanism that would ensure the applicant's confidentiality. We will address this issue with the implementation of a new e-tool in the near future.
Overall assessment					
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?				No	The lack of any suitable e-tools that allow us collect and perform data analytics of the recruiting process precludes our understanding of the accomplishment of the OTM-R objectives. This is one of the main reasons why we are trying to implement a recruitment e-tool that would allow us to perform better metrics.